

WA8LMF TNC Test CD Results

a.k.a. Battle of the TNCs

Compiled by WB2OSZ, September 2015

It's not that hard to build to build something that receives perfect APRS / AX.25 Packet Radio signals. Building something that works well, with all of the less-than-ideal signals out there, takes some effort.

How can we compare how well different TNCs perform under real world conditions?

The de facto standard of measurement is the number of packets decoded from WA8LMF's TNC Test CD obtained from <http://wa8lmf.net/TNCtest/index.htm>.

Many have published the number of packets they have been able to decode from this test. Here they are, all gathered in one place, for your reading pleasure.

WARNING: Do not take these numbers too seriously.

There are a few things to keep in mind:

1. These tests were performed by different people, different times, different places, under different conditions.
2. Some information might be outdated. Newer versions of the same thing might be better.
3. Small differences are not significant. It all depends on the mix of packets in the test. If you took another collection of about 1000, the rankings might be a little different.

| Reference | TNC | Packets decoded |
|---|----------------------------|-----------------|
| KI4MCW https://sites.google.com/site/ki4mcw/Home/arduino-tnc | Arduino Duemilanove (328p) | 871 |
| | TNC-X | 818 |
| | Argent Data OpenTracker 1+ | 729 |
| | AGWPE 2005.127 | 500 |
| | Linux PC soundmodem | 412 |
| | Linux PC multimon | 130 |
| N4MSJ http://groups.yahoo.com/group/tnc-x/message/542 | KPC-3 | 986 |
| | MFJ-1274 | 883 |
| | AEA PK90 | 728 |
| | Early Beta TT4 | 920 |
| 4X6IZ http://www.tau.ac.il/~stoledo/Bib/Pubs/QEX-JulAug-2012.pdf | AX25 Java Soundcard Modem | 964 |
| N1VG http://www.tapr.org/pipermail/aprssig/2007-May/019449.html | Tracker 2 | 910 |
| | KPC-3 (non-plus) | 967 |
| | uTNT | 970 |
| | Tracker 2 with TCM3105 | 991 |
| | AEA PK-90 | 728 |
| | MFJ-1274 | 883 |
| Microsat http://microsat.com.pl/product_info.php?products_id=100 | WX3in1 Plus 2.0 | 981 |
| UZ7HO http://www.pe0sat.vgnet.nl/tag/uz7ho/ | UZ7HO Sound-Modem 0.83b | 1021 |
| OZ7HVO & OZ1EKD http://www.kissoz.dk/ | ARM32M4F TNC platform | 994 - 998 |
| WB2OSZ https://github.com/wb2osz/direwolf/blob/master/doc/A-Better-APRS-Packet-Demodulator-Part-1-1200-baud.pdf | Dire Wolf version 1.2 | |
| | - Track 1 | 1011 |
| | - Track 2 | 1004 |

Conclusions:

Don't be obsessed by very small differences. As mentioned earlier, these numbers didn't come from careful scientifically controlled circumstances.

However, one thing is quite clear. The "software" decoders are leading the pack, leaving the modem chips behind.